| 1  | HANSON BRIDGETT LLP<br>KURT A. FRANKLIN, SBN 172715              |   |
|----|--|---|
| 2  | kfranklin@hansonbridgett.com                                     |   |
| 3  | LISA M. POOLEY, SBN 168737<br>lpooley@hansonbridgett.com         |   |
| 4  | SAMÁNTHA WOLFF, SBN 240280<br>swolff@hansonbridgett.com          |   |
| 5  | RUSSELL C. PETERSEN, SBN 264245 russ.petersen@hansonbridgett.com |   |
| 6  | CANDICE P. SHIH, SBN 294251 cshih@hansonbridgett.com             |   |
| 7  | 425 Market Street, 26th Floor<br>San Francisco, California 94105 |   |
| 8  | Telephone: (415) 777-3200<br>Facsimile: (415) 541-9366           |   |
| 9  | HANSON BRIDGETT LLP<br>TYSON M. SHOWER, SBN 190375               |   |
| 10 | tshower@hansonbridgett.com<br>LANDON D. BAILEY, SBN 240236       |   |
| 11 | lbailey@hansonbridgett.com<br>500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1500       |   |
| 12 | Sacramento, California 95814                                     |   |
| 13 | Telephone: (916) 442-3333<br>Facsimile: (916) 442-2348           |   |
| 14 | OTTEN LAW, PC  |   |
| 15 | VICTOR OTTEN, SBN 165800<br>vic@ottenlawpc.com                   | 2   |
| 16 | KAVITA TEKCHANDANI, SBN 234873<br>kavita@ottenlawpc.com          | 3   |
| 17 | 3620 Pacific Coast Highway, #100<br>Torrance, California 90505   |   |
| 18 | Telephone: (310) 378-8533<br>Facsimile: (310) 347-4225           |   |
| 19 | Attorneys for Plaintiffs CORY SPENCER, DIANA MILENA              |   |
| 20 | REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION                                     |   |
| 21 | RANGERS, INC.  |   |
| 22 | UNITED STATES  | DISTRICT COURT                              |
| 23 | CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CAL  | IFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION                   |
| 24 |  |   |
| 25 | CORY SPENCER, an individual;                                     | CASE NO. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)           |
| 26 | DIANA MILENA REED, an  | PLAINTIFFS' EX PARTE                        |
| 27 | individual; and COASTAL PROTECTION RANGERS, INC., a              | APPLICATION FOR AN ORDER SETTING HEARING ON |
| 28 | California non-profit public benefit                             | PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SANCTIONS AGAINST    |
|    | 1  |   |

**DEFENDANTS BLAKEMAN AND** corporation, 1 THE CITY OF PALOS VERDES 2 **ESTATES** Plaintiffs, 3 V. 4 LUNADA BAY BOYS; THE 5 INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS OF THE LUNADA BAY BOYS, including but 6 not limited to SANG LEE, BRANT 7 BLAKEMAN, ALAN JOHNSTON 8 Complaint Filed: March 29, 2016 AKA JALIAN JOHNSTON, Trial Date: December 12, 2017 MICHAEL RAE PAPAYANS, ANGELO FERRARA, FRANK 10 FERRARA, CHARLIE FERRARA, and N. F.: CITY OF PALOS VERDES 11 ESTATES; CHIEF OF POLICE JEFF KEPLEY, in his representative 12 capacity; and DOES 1-10, 13 14 Defendants. 15 I. APPLICATION 16 17 Plaintiffs file this ex parte application for an order setting a hearing date on their Motion for Sanctions against Defendants Blakeman and the City of Palos 18 19 Verdes Estates (Sanctions Motion). Specifically, Plaintiffs request that their 20 Sanctions Motion be heard by this Court at the parties' Pretrial Conference, on 21 November 27, 2017 at 10:00 a.m. or on shortened time on a date determined by the 22 Court. 23 II. MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF APPLICATION 24 Plaintiffs request that their Sanctions Motion be heard at the parties' Pretrial 25 Conference or on shortened time, whichever the Court prefers. The basis for Plaintiffs' motion is that critical evidence was withheld by Defendants Blakeman 26 27 and the City of Palos Verdes Estates (City) during the course of discovery, and was 28 only recently produced by Defendant Papayans pursuant to a September 12, 2017

PLTFS.' EX PARTE APP. FOR AN ORDER SETTING HRG. ON PLTFS.' MOT. FOR SANCTIONS

Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)

court order. (See Sept. 13, 2017 Minute Order, Dock. No. 452.) Per the September 1 12, 2017 Order, Defendant Papayans was required to produce no later than 2 3 September 22, 2017 certain relevant information that had been in the custody of Papayans' criminal defense attorney. (Id.) On October 2, 2017, Defendant 4 5 Papayans produced over 500 pages of previously unproduced text messages, Bates stamped MP 00117 to MP 00618. (Decl. S. Wolff Supp. Pltfs.' Mot. for Sanctions 6 Against Defs. Blakeman and City of Palos Verdes Estates (Decl. Wolff), ¶ 20.) 7 8 Papayans' October 2, 2017 production included scores of previously unproduced text messages that were received by Defendant Blakeman on his City-owned cell 9 phone that are critical to Plaintiffs' allegations. (Id. at  $\P$  21.) None of these text 10 11 messages had been produced by any party prior to Papayans' production, and were apparently spoliated by Defendants Blakeman and the City. (Id.) 12 13 Through this ex parte application, Plaintiffs seek to have their Sanctions Motion heard at the parties' Pretrial Conference. Plaintiffs have brought their 14 Sanctions Motion at the earliest possible opportunity. Indeed, Plaintiffs initiated a 15 meet-and-confer effort with Defendants regarding their spoliation of evidence on the 16 same day as Defendant Papayans' production. (Decl. Wolff, ¶ 22.) Had Defendant 17 Papayans produced the relevant and critical text messages before the discovery cut-18 off date, Plaintiffs could have filed their Sanctions Motion before the motion cut-off 19 20 date. 21

22

23

24

25

26

2728

Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Plaintiffs initiated a meet-and-confer discussion with Defendants Blakeman and the City regarding their spoliation of relevant electronically stored information the same day Plaintiffs received Defendant Papayans' production, on October 2, 2017. (Id. at ¶ 22.) Plaintiffs' meet-and-confer efforts with the City spanned from October 2, 2017 to October 19, 2017. (Id. at ¶¶ 22-25, 32-37.) Plaintiffs exchanged written correspondence with counsel for Defendant Blakeman from October 2, 2017 to October 19, 2017, though counsel for Defendant Blakeman refused to discuss the substance of Plaintiffs' motion. (Id. at ¶¶ 22, 23, 26-31.)

| On October 30, 2017, Plaintiffs' counsel telephoned counsel for Defendants   |
|--|
| Blakeman and the City to discuss Plaintiffs' ex parte application to have Plaintiffs'  |
| Sanctions Motion heard at the parties' November 27, 2017 Pretrial Conference.  |
| Specifically, Plaintiffs' counsel, Lisa Pooley, contacted the following counsel for  |
| Defendants Blakeman and the City:  |
| Christopher Glos Edmund Richards Antoinette Hewitt Jacob Song Rebecca Wilson Kutak Rock LLP 5 Park Plz., Suite 1500 Irvine, CA 92614 (949) 417-0999 christopher.glos@kutakrock.com antoinette.hewitt@kutakrock.com Jacob.song@kutakrock.com ed.richards@kutakrock.com  |
| Robert Crossin Buchalter, A Professional Corporation 1000 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 1500 Los Angeles, CA 90017-1730 (213) 891-0700 rcooper@buchalter.com  |
| (Decl. Pooley, ¶¶ 2-3.) Defense counsel for the City and for Defendant Blakeman indicated that they oppose Plaintiffs' <i>ex parte</i> application. ( <i>Id</i> .)   |
| III. CONCLUSION  |
| Plaintiffs respectfully ask this Court to grant their <i>ex parte</i> application and permit their Sanctions Motion to be heard at the November 27, 2017 Pretrial Conference or on shortened time on a date selected by the Court. On the other hand, if Plaintiffs' <i>ex parte</i> application is denied, Plaintiffs will suffer severe prejudice if |
| i de la companya de  |

13912871.1

| 1  | Defendants Blakeman and the City's spoliation of evidence goes unaddressed by |
|----|---|
| 2  | this Court.   |
| 3  | DATED: October 30, 2017 HANSON BRIDGETT LLP                                   |
| 4  |   |
| 5  |   |
| 6  | By: /s/ Samantha D. Wolff  KURT A. FRANKLIN                                   |
| 7  | LISA M. POOLEY  |
| 8  | SAMANTHA D. WOLFF Attorneys for Plaintiffs                                    |
| 9  | CORY SPENCER, DIANA MILENA  |
| 10 | REED, and COASTAL PROTECTION RANGERS, INC.                                    |
| 11 |   |
| 12 |   |
| 13 |   |
| 14 |   |
| 15 |   |
| 16 |   |
| 17 |   |
| 18 |   |
| 19 |   |
| 20 |   |
| 21 |   |
| 22 |   |
| 23 |   |
| 24 |   |
| 25 |   |
| 26 |   |
| 27 |   |
| 28 | _5_ Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)   |
| I  | _5_ Case No. 2:16-cv-02129-SJO (RAOx)   |